Bargaining for Trade: When Exporting Becomes Detrimental to Female Wages

(Daniel Halvarsson, Olga Lark, Patrik Tingvall & Josefin Videnord)

Discussion by Federica De Pace (OECD*)

FIW, EUI Seminars Series in International Economics September 19, 2023

*The views expressed in this presentation are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect those of the OECD and its member countries

Motivation

- Among major policy concerns
 - rise in income inequality associated to globalization
 - persistent wage gap between men and women
- Does globalization affect the gender wage gap (GWG)?
 - Little and mixed evidence at sector and firm level
 - Linked to flexibility of working hours (Boler et al, 2018)
 - Linked to task content in occupation (Bonfiglioli and De Pace, 2021)
- This paper:
 - estimates the effect of firm's export on the GWG at firm-employee level
 - how exports affect the wage gap between male-female coworkers
 - explores mechanisms

What the Authors Do

- Use matched employer-employee data for Sweden and indices of Contract Intensity (CI) across industries (1997-2015)
- Estimate worker-firm wage equations
 - identification out of
 - variation in export at firm-time level
 - variation in wage of each worker matched with the firm
- Classify industries based on CI (Nunn, 2007)
 - contract-intensive industries: products that use more inputs that are not sold on an organized exchange and require more bargaining to complete a deal
- Proposed explanation Male workers' comparative advantage in bargaining when serving foreign markets

Main Results

- As the firm increases export intensity, GWG increases
- More so for workers in high-Cl industries
 - effect is irrespective of education level
 - but concentrated among white-collar, managers (but also tech workers)

Addressing the channels

What is so different about export?

- Export VS Domestic Sales
 - No effect of domestic sales on GWG
- Export VS foreign ownership
 - No effect of trade with external foreign partners
- Hypothesis: gender-specific comparative advantage in negotiations
 - Exporting especially of goods that involve more buyer-seller interactions requires more "male skills"
 - Firms value relatively more current male workers, especially in high contractintensity industries

Discussion – Alternative channels?

- Countries of destination effect?
 - Sweden should have a CA in CI goods and sell them to countries with low institutional quality, which happen to have more gender inequality
 - But then, is it about male CA in bargaining or discrimination (e.g. Lark and Videnord, 2023)?
 - Bargaining is important vis-à-vis the supplier of inputs that are not sold on organized markets, not necessarily in export of CI goods

Discussion – What to do?

Depends on the channel

- If male CA in bargaining (with foreign clients but also with the employer) is main channel:
 - More training activities
 - Implement pay transparency (especially in international firms) and *Equal pay audits* (OECD, 2023)
- If others :
 - Improve rule of law across trading partners